

Appraisal of open software for finite element simulation of 2D metal sheet laser cut

International Journal on Interactive Design and Manufacturing (IJIDeM)
pp 1–12

Authors Authors and affiliations

Daniel Mejia, Aitor Moreno, Oscar Ruiz-Salguero, Iñigo Barandiaran

Original Paper

First Online: 21 March 2016

DOI (Digital Object Identifier): 10.1007/s12008-016-0308-5

Cite this article as:

Mejia, D., Moreno, A., Ruiz-Salguero, O. et al. Int J Interact Des Manuf (2016).
doi:10.1007/s12008-016-0308-5

105

Views

Abstract

FEA simulation of thermal metal cutting is central to interactive design and manufacturing. It is therefore relevant to assess the applicability of FEA open software to simulate 2D heat transfer in metal sheet laser cuts. Application of open source code (e.g. FreeFem++, FEniCS, MOOSE) makes possible additional scenarios (e.g. parallel, CUDA, etc.), with lower costs. However, a precise assessment is required on the scenarios in which open software can be a sound alternative to a commercial one. This article contributes in this regard, by presenting a comparison of the aforementioned freeware FEM software for the simulation of heat transfer in thin (i.e. 2D) sheets, subject to a gliding laser point source. We use the commercial ABAQUS software as the reference to compare such open software. A convective linear thin sheet heat transfer model, with and without material removal is used. This article does not intend a full design of computer experiments. Our partial assessment shows that the thin sheet approximation

Loading [MathJax]/jax/output/HTML-CSS/jax.js error for linear alumina sheets. Under mesh resolutions better than 10^{-6} m, the open and reference software temperature

differ in at most 1 % of the temperature prediction. Ongoing work includes adaptive re-meshing, nonlinearities, sheet stress analysis and Mach (also called ‘relativistic’) effects.

Keywords

Laser machining Sheet cutting Heat transfer Finite element analysis

Abbreviations

FEM/FEA

Finite element method/finite element analysis

\mathbf{x}, t

Coordinates describing the spatial $[x, y]$ and temporal $t \geq 0$ domain of the simulation $([m, m], s)$

$u = u(\mathbf{x}, t)$

Temperature distribution along the sheet at a given time (K)

ρ

Sheet metal density $\left(\frac{\text{kg}}{\text{m}^3}\right)$

c_p

Sheet specific heat capacity $\left(\frac{\text{J}}{\text{kg K}}\right)$

k

Sheet thermal conductivity $\left(\frac{\text{W}}{\text{m K}}\right)$

R

Sheet reflectivity i.e., portion of the laser energy that is not absorbed by the sheet ($0 \leq R \leq 1$)

Δz

Sheet thickness (m)

$q = q(u)$

Heat loss due to convection at the sheet surface $\left(\frac{\text{W}}{\text{m}^2}\right)$

h

Natural convection coefficient of the sheet surrounding medium $\left(\frac{\text{W}}{\text{m}^2 \text{K}}\right)$

u_∞

Temperature of the sheet surrounding medium (K)

$S = S(\mathbf{x}, t)$

Laser power density distribution along the sheet at a given time $\left(\frac{\text{W}}{\text{m}^2}\right)$

P

Laser power (W)

σ

Gaussian laser model's parameter (m)

$\mathbf{x}_0 = \mathbf{x}_0(t)$

Laser spot 2D coordinates $[x_0(t), y_0(t)]$ at a given time $([m, m])$

v

Laser scanning speed $\left(\frac{\text{m}}{\text{s}}\right)$

ε

Kerf width of the laser (m)

$u_{ref} = u_{ref}(\mathbf{x}, t)$

Reference temperature used to measure the relative error of a given solution (K).

This article considers the temperature distribution obtained by the ABAQUS software as reference

$E = E(\mathbf{x}, t)$

Relative error distribution of a software approximation w.r.t. u_{ref} along the sheet at a given time

$ME = ME(t)$

Maximum relative error of a software temperature approximation w.r.t. u_{ref} at a given time

References

1. Posada, J., Toro, C., Barandiaran, I., Oyarzun, D., Stricker, D., De Amicis, R., Pinto, E., Eisert, P., Dollner, J., Vallarino, I.: Visual computing as a key enabling technology for industrie 4.0 and industrial internet. IEEE Comput. Graph. **35**(2), 26–40 (2015). doi:[10.1109/MCG.2015.45](https://doi.org/10.1109/MCG.2015.45) (<http://dx.doi.org/10.1109/MCG.2015.45>)
[CrossRef](http://dx.doi.org/10.1109/MCG.2015.45) (<http://dx.doi.org/10.1109/MCG.2015.45>)
2. Yilbas, B.S., Arif, A.F.M., Abdul Aleem, B.J.: Laser cutting of rectangular blanks in thick sheet steel: effect of cutting speed on thermal stresses. J. Mater. Eng. Perform. **19**(2), 177–184 (2010). doi:[10.1007/s11665-009-9477-8](https://doi.org/10.1007/s11665-009-9477-8)
(<http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s11665-009-9477-8>)
[CrossRef](http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s11665-009-9477-8) (<http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s11665-009-9477-8>)
3. Song, W.Q., Xu, W.J., Wang, X.Y., Meng, J.B., Li, H.Y.: Numerical simulation of temperature field in plasma-arc flexible forming of laminated-composite metal sheets. Trans. Nonferr. Metals Soc. **19**, s61–s67 (2009). doi:[10.1016/S1003-6326\(10\)60246-4](https://doi.org/10.1016/S1003-6326(10)60246-4)
([http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/S1003-6326\(10\)60246-4](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/S1003-6326(10)60246-4))
[CrossRef](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/S1003-6326(10)60246-4) ([http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/S1003-6326\(10\)60246-4](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/S1003-6326(10)60246-4))
4. Joshi, A., Kansara, N., Das, S., Kuppan, P., Venkatesan, K.: A study of temperature Loading [MathJax]/jax/output/HTML-CSS/jax.js i-6al-4 v alloy. Proc. Eng. **97**, 1466–1473

(2014). doi:[10.1016/j.proeng.2014.12.430](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.proeng.2014.12.430)

(<http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.proeng.2014.12.430>)

[CrossRef](#) (<http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.proeng.2014.12.430>).

5. Tagliaferri, F., Leopardi, G., Semmler, U., Kuhl, M., Palumbo, B.: Study of the influences of laser parameters on laser assisted machining processes. *Proc. CIRP* **8**, 170–175 (2013). doi:[10.1016/j.procir.2013.06.084](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.procir.2013.06.084)
(<http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.procir.2013.06.084>)
[CrossRef](#) (<http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.procir.2013.06.084>).
6. Akarapu, R., Li, B.Q., Segall, A.: A thermal stress and failure model for laser cutting and forming operations. *J. Fail. Anal. Prev.* **4**(5), 51–62 (2004).
doi:[10.1361/15477020420756](https://doi.org/10.1361/15477020420756) (<http://dx.doi.org/10.1361/15477020420756>)
[CrossRef](#) (<http://dx.doi.org/10.1361/15477020420756>).
7. Yilbas, B.S., Akhtar, S.S.: Laser bending of metal sheet and thermal stress analysis. *Opt. Laser Technol.* **61**, 34–44 (2014). doi:[10.1016/j.optlastec.2013.12.023](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.optlastec.2013.12.023)
(<http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.optlastec.2013.12.023>)
[CrossRef](#) (<http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.optlastec.2013.12.023>).
8. Akhtar, S.S.: Laser cutting of thick-section circular blanks: thermal stress prediction and microstructural analysis. *Int. J. Adv. Manuf. Tech.* **71**(5–8), 1345–1358 (2014).
doi:[10.1007/s00170-013-5594-5](https://doi.org/10.1007/s00170-013-5594-5) (<http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s00170-013-5594-5>)
[CrossRef](#) (<http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s00170-013-5594-5>).
9. Nadeem, Q., Na, S.J.: Deformation behavior of laser bending of circular sheet metal. *Chin. Opt. Lett.* **9**(5), 051402 (2011). doi:[10.3788/COL201109.051402](https://doi.org/10.3788/COL201109.051402)
(<http://dx.doi.org/10.3788/COL201109.051402>)
[CrossRef](#) (<http://dx.doi.org/10.3788/COL201109.051402>).
10. Yilbas, B.S., Akhtar, S.S., Karatas, C.: Laser straight cutting of alumina tiles: thermal stress analysis. *Int. J. Adv. Manuf. Tech.* **58**(9–12), 1019–1030 (2012).
doi:[10.1007/s00170-011-3439-7](https://doi.org/10.1007/s00170-011-3439-7) (<http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s00170-011-3439-7>)
[CrossRef](#) (<http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s00170-011-3439-7>).
11. Akhtar, S., Kardas, O.O., Keles, O., Yilbas, B.S.: Laser cutting of rectangular geometry into aluminum alloy: Effect of cut sizes on thermal stress field. *Opt. Laser Eng.* **61**, 57–66 (2014). doi:[10.1016/j.optlaseng.2014.04.016](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.optlaseng.2014.04.016)
(<http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.optlaseng.2014.04.016>)
[CrossRef](#) (<http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.optlaseng.2014.04.016>).
12. Nyon, K.Y., Nyeoh, C.Y., Mokhtar, M., Abdul-Rahman, R.: Finite element analysis of laser inert gas cutting on inconel 718. *Int. J. Adv. Manuf. Tech.* **60**(9–12), 995–1007 (2012). doi:[10.1007/s00170-011-3655-1](https://doi.org/10.1007/s00170-011-3655-1) (<http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s00170-011-3655-1>)
[CrossRef](#) (<http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s00170-011-3655-1>).
13. Yan, Y., Ji, L., Bao, Y., Chen, X., Jiang, Y.: CO₂ laser high-speed crack-free cutting of thick-section alumina based on close-piercing lapping technique. *Int. J. Adv. Manuf. Tech.* **64**(9–12), 1611–1624 (2013). doi:[10.1007/s00170-012-4127-y](https://doi.org/10.1007/s00170-012-4127-y)
(<http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s00170-012-4127-y>)

14. Yan, Y., Li, L., Sezer, K., Wang, W., Whitehead, D., Ji, L., Bao, Y., Jiang, Y.: CO₂ laser underwater machining of deep cavities in alumina. *J. Eur. Ceram. Soc.* **31**(15), 2793–2807 (2011). doi:[10.1016/j.jeurceramsoc.2011.06.015](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jeurceramsoc.2011.06.015)
(<http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.jeurceramsoc.2011.06.015>)
[CrossRef](#) (<http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.jeurceramsoc.2011.06.015>)
15. Gross, M.S.: On gas dynamic effects in the modelling of laser cutting processes. *Appl. Math. Model.* **30**(4), 307–318 (2006). doi:[10.1016/j.apm.2005.03.021](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.apm.2005.03.021)
(<http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.apm.2005.03.021>)
[CrossRef](#) (<http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.apm.2005.03.021>)
[MATH](#) (<http://www.emis.de/MATH-item?1163.76399>)
16. Modest, M.F.: Three-dimensional, transient model for laser machining of ablating/decomposing materials. *Int. J. Heat Mass Transf.* **39**(2), 221–234 (1996). doi:[10.1016/0017-9310\(95\)00134-U](https://doi.org/10.1016/0017-9310(95)00134-U) ([http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/0017-9310\(95\)00134-U](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/0017-9310(95)00134-U))
[CrossRef](#) ([http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/0017-9310\(95\)00134-U](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/0017-9310(95)00134-U))
17. Modest, M.F.: Laser through-cutting and drilling models for ablating/decomposing materials. *J. Laser Appl.* **9**(3), 137–145 (1997). doi:[10.2351/1.4745453](https://doi.org/10.2351/1.4745453)
(<http://dx.doi.org/10.2351/1.4745453>)
[CrossRef](#) (<http://dx.doi.org/10.2351/1.4745453>)
18. Kim, M.J.: Transient evaporative laser-cutting with boundary element method. *Appl. Math. Model.* **25**(1), 25–39 (2000). doi:[10.1016/S0307-904X\(00\)00034-2](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0307-904X(00)00034-2)
([http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/S0307-904X\(00\)00034-2](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/S0307-904X(00)00034-2))
[CrossRef](#) ([http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/S0307-904X\(00\)00034-2](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/S0307-904X(00)00034-2))
[MATH](#) (<http://www.emis.de/MATH-item?1076.74565>)
19. Kim, M.J.: Transient evaporative laser cutting with moving laser by boundary element method. *Appl. Math. Model.* **28**(10), 891–910 (2004). doi:[10.1016/j.apm.2004.03.001](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.apm.2004.03.001)
(<http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.apm.2004.03.001>)
[CrossRef](#) (<http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.apm.2004.03.001>)
[MATH](#) (<http://www.emis.de/MATH-item?1147.74404>)
20. Dubey, A.K., Yadava, V.: Laser beam machining: a review. *Int. J. Mach. Tool. Manu.* **48**(6), 609–628 (2008). doi:[10.1016/j.ijmachtools.2007.10.017](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijmachtools.2007.10.017)
(<http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.ijmachtools.2007.10.017>)
[CrossRef](#) (<http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.ijmachtools.2007.10.017>)
21. Parandoush, P., Hossain, A.: A review of modeling and simulation of laser beam machining. *Int. J. Mach. Tool. Manu.* **85**, 135–145 (2014). doi:[10.1016/j.ijmachtools.2014.05.008](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijmachtools.2014.05.008)
(<http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.ijmachtools.2014.05.008>)
[CrossRef](#) (<http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.ijmachtools.2014.05.008>)
22. Hecht, F.: New development in FreeFem++. *J. Numer. Math.* **20**(3–4), 251–265 (2012). doi:[10.1515/jnum-2012-0013](https://doi.org/10.1515/jnum-2012-0013) (<http://dx.doi.org/10.1515/jnum-2012-0013>)
[MathSciNet](#) (<http://www.ams.org/mathscinet-getitem?mr=3043640>)
[MATH](#) (<http://www.emis.de/MATH-item?1266.68090>)

84. Springer, Heidelberg (2012)

CrossRef (<http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/978-3-642-23099-8>)

MATH (<http://www.emis.de/MATH-item?1247.65105>)

24. Gaston, D., Newman, C., Hansen, G., Lebrun-Grandi, D.: MOOSE: a parallel computational framework for coupled systems of nonlinear equations. *Nucl. Eng. Des.* **239**(10), 1768–1778 (2009). doi:[10.1016/j.nucengdes.2009.05.021](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.nucengdes.2009.05.021)
(<http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.nucengdes.2009.05.021>)
CrossRef (<http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.nucengdes.2009.05.021>)
25. Strickland, M.A., Arsene, C.T.C., Pal, S., Laz, P.J., Taylor, M.: A multi-platform comparison of efficient probabilistic methods in the prediction of total knee replacement mechanics. *Comput. Method. Biomech.* **13**(6), 701–709 (2010). doi:[10.1080/10255840903476463](https://doi.org/10.1080/10255840903476463) (<http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/10255840903476463>)
CrossRef (<http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/10255840903476463>)
26. Roith, B., Troll, A., Rieg, F.: Integrated finite element analysis (FEA) in three-dimensional computer aided design programs (CAD)—overview and comparison. In: Bocquet J.C. (ed.) *Proceedings of ICED 2007, the 17th international conference on engineering design*, pp. 1–12. The Design Society (2007)
27. Pietro, P.D., Yao, Y.L.: A numerical investigation into cutting front mobility in CO₂ laser cutting. *Int. J. Mach. Tool. Manu.* **35**(5), 673–688 (1995). doi:[10.1016/0890-6955\(95\)93037-7](https://doi.org/10.1016/0890-6955(95)93037-7) ([http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/0890-6955\(95\)93037-7](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/0890-6955(95)93037-7))
CrossRef ([http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/0890-6955\(95\)93037-7](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/0890-6955(95)93037-7))
28. Aloke, R., Girish, V., Scrutton, R.F., Molian, P.A.: A model for prediction of dimensional tolerances of laser cut holes in mild steel thin plates. *Int. J. Mach. Tool. Manu.* **37**(8), 1069–1078 (1997). doi:[10.1016/S0890-6955\(96\)00090-9](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0890-6955(96)00090-9)
([http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/S0890-6955\(96\)00090-9](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/S0890-6955(96)00090-9))
CrossRef ([http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/S0890-6955\(96\)00090-9](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/S0890-6955(96)00090-9))
29. Moreno, A., Segura, A., Arregui, H., Posada, J., Ruíz de Infante, A., Canto, N.: Using 2d contours to model metal sheets in industrial machining processes. In: De Amicis R., Conti G. (eds.) *Future Vision and Trends on Shapes, Geometry and Algebra*. Springer Proceedings in Mathematics Statistics, vol. 84, pp. 135–149. Springer, London (2014)
30. Ali, Y., Zhang, L.: Relativistic heat conduction. *Int. J. Heat Mass Transf.* **48**(12), 2397–2406 (2005). doi:[10.1016/j.ijheatmasstransfer.2005.02.003](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijheatmasstransfer.2005.02.003)
(<http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.ijheatmasstransfer.2005.02.003>)
CrossRef (<http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.ijheatmasstransfer.2005.02.003>)
MATH (<http://www.emis.de/MATH-item?1189.80009>)
31. Jiang, H.J., Dai, H.L.: Effect of laser processing on three dimensional thermodynamic analysis for HSLA rectangular steel plates. *Int. J. Heat Mass Transf.* **82**, 98–108 (2015). doi:[10.1016/j.ijheatmasstransfer.2014.11.003](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijheatmasstransfer.2014.11.003)
(<http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.ijheatmasstransfer.2014.11.003>)
CrossRef (<http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.ijheatmasstransfer.2014.11.003>)
32. Boffy, H., Baietto, M.C., Sainsot, P., Lubrecht, A.A.: Detailed modelling of a moving heat source using multigrid methods. *Tribol. Int.* **46**(1), 279–287 (2012). doi:[10.1016/j.triboint.2011.06.011](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.triboint.2011.06.011)
(<http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.triboint.2011.06.011>)
CrossRef (<http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.triboint.2011.06.011>)

Copyright information

© Springer-Verlag France 2016

About this article

**Print ISSN**

1955-2513

Online ISSN

1955-2505

Publisher Name

Springer Paris

[About this journal](#)[Reprints and Permissions](#)

SPRINGER NATURE

© 2016 Springer International Publishing. Part of [Springer Nature](#).

Not logged in · Not affiliated · 200.12.182.187